

Performance Audit Response Transportation Action Plan & Rationale 2010-2011

Transportation Recommendations from Ohio Auditor of State Mary Taylor:

Revise its Walkers and Riders policy to adopt state minimum requirements for bus service levels and modify its policy guidelines to grant management the right to make exceptions to bus service levels as deemed appropriate, such as in high traffic areas.

Develop written processes and procedures for reporting transportation data and submitting its T report to ODE.

Implement leading practices for designing its routing system in order to meet benchmark capacity utilization and reduce up to 9 buses.

Guiding Questions:

- How do the District's transportation policies and procedures compare with leading practices and affect its operations? (Policies)
- How can the District improve the accuracy and reliability of its transportation data?
- How does the District's "yellow bus" (Type I- regular, special needs, nonpublic & community school) transportation service compare with peer districts and/or industry standards? (Operating ratios & Costs)
- Is the District's transportation function operating efficiently and effectively? (Ridership efficiency)

Please Note: Routes vs. Runs

A route is several bus runs assembled together which includes driver hours, part time benefits, and a cost including 12,000 miles per year. A bus run is strictly based on a part time driver's wages not including benefits and mileage.

Response and Action Plan:

Our goal is to explore and adjust transportation practices with a focus on improving transportation efficiency and reliability. We have identified three areas to explore with the highest cost savings listed first.

1. Create a Board Policy for Nonpublic Transportation Ridership Minimums

We currently transport 318 nonpublic school students to a variety of locations across Franklin County. We do receive some reimbursement for students we transport. Our recommendation is to create policy and guidelines to limit transportation of Nonpublic routes to ten or more students per route. It is impractical to provide transportation for bus routing under ten students. This policy would result in payment of \$178.00 to each family in lieu of transportation. This change will save the District **\$214,020.00 per year**. We currently pay \$567,445.20 to transport 318 nonpublic students.

T-4 Reimbursement = \$55,650.00
 Cost= \$677,473.20
 Total Miles (per day) = 842
 Annual Miles= 151,560
 Reimbursement = \$110,028.00
 Actual Cost = \$567,445.20

Our recommendation for cost savings:

- ⊙ Identify Non-Public and Community Schools impractical to transport. (10 Schools having 7 or less students transported)
- ⊙ # of Non-Public students attending identified 10 schools (43)
- ⊙ Amount paid to families for transportation (\$178.00 X 43= \$7,654.00)
- ⊙ Actual savings to District (\$221,674.40 - \$7,654.00= \$214,020.00)

Identify the following Non-Public and Community Schools impractical to transport.

Impractical to Transport for 2011-2012						
<u>School</u>	<u># of Students</u>	<u>Annual Miles</u>	<u>Cost</u>	<u>Reimbursement</u>	<u>Actual Cost & Cost per student</u>	<u>Pay Family \$178.00 to Transport</u>
A	4	6300	\$28,161.00	\$1,384.00	\$26,777.00/ \$6,694.25	\$712.00
B	6	8280	\$37,011.60	\$2,076.00	\$34,935.60/ \$5,822.60	\$1,068.00
C	2	4140	\$18,505.80	\$692.00	\$17,813.80/ \$8,906.90	\$356.00
D	7	7560	\$33,793.20	\$2,422.00	\$31,371.20/ \$4,481.60	\$1,246.00
E	2	1800	\$8,046.00	\$692.00	\$7,354.00/ \$3,677.00	\$356.00
F	6	5400	\$24,138.00	\$2,076.00	\$22,062.00/ \$3,677.00	\$1,068.00
G	6	5400	\$24,138.00	\$2,076.00	\$22,062.00/ \$3,677.00	\$1,068.00
H	4	4320	\$19,310.40	\$1,384.00	\$17,926.40/ \$4,481.60	\$712.00
I	1	2520	\$11,264.40	\$346.00	\$10,918.40/ \$10,918.40	\$178.00
J	5	7200	\$32,184.00	\$1,730.00	\$30,454.00/ \$6,090.00	\$890.00
Totals	43	52,920	\$236,552.40	\$14,878.00	\$221,674.40	\$7654.00

If deemed Impractical by the our Board of Education, our Total Savings = **\$214,020.00 per year**

2. Explore: Adjusting Start and End Times for Two Schools

Proposed Changes to Early/Late Start Schools:

We are exploring two Late Start Elementary Schools changing to Early Start Schools. We have communicated with building principals and are currently in the process of asking parents for thoughts and considerations as we explore this concept. This adjustment will reduce 2-3 bus routes and drivers resulting in a cost savings of over \$100,000 a year.

Current Early/Late Start Elementary Schools:

Early Start Schools (2010-11)

- School Times for two elementary schools (8:00 a.m. – 2:30 p.m.)
- School Times for two elementary schools (7:55 a.m. – 2:25 p.m.)

Late Start Schools (2010-11)

- School times for seven elementary schools (8:20 a.m. – 2:50 p.m.)
- School time for one elementary school (8:15 a.m. – 2:45 p.m.)

3. Exploring changes to current bus routing

Elementary and Middle Schools

Board Policy states that we transport students living more than 1.5 Miles from school. We currently transport 473 Elementary and Middle School aged students living within 1.5 miles. (Result: Eliminate five bus runs and save \$30,000)

Reasons for transporting:

- The construction of Hard Road
- Safe walking route to school
- No “safe” walkway
- Ample space for student drop-off
- Clearing of walkways

High School

Board Policy states that we transport high school students living more than 2 Miles from school. We currently transport 159 High School aged students living within 2 miles. (Result: Eliminate one bus runs and save \$6,000)

- The construction of Hard Road
- Safe walking route to school
- Clearing of walkways

Please Note:

Before any adjustment can be made in this area, we will investigate changes in the conditions at each level.

Hard Road Train Overpass (To create safer walking route)

Contacted Mr. Terry L Stewart, (Community Mobility Engineer, Division of Mobility Options, Department of Public Services, City of Columbus) to discuss the possibility of creating a safer route to school by placing pylons between Hard Road and the sidewalk under the train overpass.

Other changes implemented 2010-2011 school year...

Transitioning away from school choice in Olentangy Highlands

This would promote transportation efficiency and allow transporting more students on the current four buses assigned to that area. (Indirect cost savings)

Typical Students Riding Special Needs Bus Routes

We changed our practice allowing typical education students to ride bus routes intended for special needs pre-school students.

Result: We reduced 1 bus and driver this year. (Cost savings- \$10,000)

Second Round of Bus Routes (December 2010 student counts)

School	Avg. Ridership	Target Ridership	Notes/ Reasons
TWHS	39	38	Good
WKHS	41	38	Good
KMS	39	38	Good
McCord	32	38	Walkers in the Liberty attendance area caused this because we needed to add a run to accommodate them.
WW	34	38	Reducing a bus would make buses late to WWAY in the morning due to rush hour traffic.
Bluffsview	48	57	This is the result of Overflow and logistics on Linworth Rd.
Brookside Colonial Hills	44	57	Adding to these routes makes buses late to Brookside in am and EV ST in pm
EV ST	35	57	Good
Granby	48	57	We were overcrowded due to Riverlee on bus 14 and could not make our TWHS route on time in the afternoon which added 2 buses.
Liberty	48	57	Bus 61 could not make times and we needed to add a new run at Granby
Slate Hill	43	57	This is low due to walkers and overflow students
Wilson Hill	45	57	This is due to overflow from Colonial Hills and WES
WES	44	57	Due to overflow from Colonial Hills
WoHills	40	57	Due to large area on east side of district and ability to make am time at WES and PM time to TWHS
WoPark	43	57	Times are too tight to make AM start time after leaving early school.
			Due to overflow from Colonial Hills and a Wilson Hill Special Ed student.

We have eliminated a mid day route for the remainder of this school year reducing a full time driver.

Revised 2/8/11 GJJ